

# Git Bisect Your Way to Fame and Fortune

by Trevor E Cordes

(c) 2015

Presented to Manitoba UNIX User Group

June 9, 2015

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License

# Presentation Method

- Lots to cover
- Gloss over details / commands
- Download and reference the detailed slides later
- Story
- Template for attacking your own bugs
- Start to finish

# OS Upgrades Are Fun

- NOT!
- My MythTV / fileserver box
- From Fedora 19 to 21
- All seemed well

# 2 Days Later...

- MythTV records TV shows off cable: free Tivo
- But better
- Why is MythTV recording the wrong channel?
- Everything is channel 2... lame
- Formula 1 season is about to start (go McLaren!)
- Downton Abbey season isn't done yet!
- Gasp!

# There Goes WAF

- Just when I get MythTV fully Wife Acceptance Factored...
- Eventually broke out the ol' VHS tape and used a VCR
- Knew this bug wasn't getting solved quickly

# The Bug Is...

- MythTV uses LIRC infrared tool
- To change channels on the cable box
- Via an IR blaster plugged in via USB
- LIRC blasting seems broken
- Test: `irsend SEND_ONCE dct700 info`
- `timeout`

# Solving The Bug Part 0

- March 10
- Report bug on RedHat Bugzilla (rhubz)
- [https://bugzilla.redhat.com/show\\_bug.cgi?id=1200353](https://bugzilla.redhat.com/show_bug.cgi?id=1200353)

# Debug Mode

- Many programs have a debug/verbose mode
- lircd can be run in debug mode



# strace

- Can run strace against any program
- See where it is hanging:
- `strace irsend`
- `strace lircd`
- `lircd` is hanging on write to `/dev/lirc0`

# Cheat With Wrong OS Ver Pkgs

- Installed Fedora 22's lirc rpm
- Installed Fedora 20's lirc rpm
- Doesn't always work: package / library conflicts
- Got lucky
- But bug remains

# Try Older Kernel

- Fedora 20 original kernel
- v3.11
- On F21's userspace
- lck
- But bug disappears!

# Bug Is In Kernel You Git!

- So let's use git
- git is the source code control system used by Linus Torvalds and the kernel devs

# 30s Git Primer

- Source code control / versioning system
- Taking the world by storm
- Like: RCS, CVS, subversion, mercurial
- But no central or master server or repo
- Everyone works on their own copy
- Everyone is equal, even Linus
- Stores full files, not diffs
- Easy merges (push, pull) put it all together

# Handy Git Cheatsheet

- Update your repo to the very latest version
- `git fetch origin`
- Reset your repo to start state after tinkering
- `git reset --hard origin/master`
- Reset to start state after a bisect
- `git bisect reset`

# Git Yourself The Kernel Source

- git clone  
git://git.kernel.org/pub/scm/linux/kernel/git/torvalds/linux.git linux-git
- Shockingly fast...

# What Source File?

- lsmod
- Unplug the USB blaster, replug
- What module got loaded?
- mceusb
- `find . | grep mceusb`
- `drivers/media/rc/mceusb.c`



# Simple Driver Hacking

- Like all programmers...
- Have a bug, add some prints
- `printk(KERN_DEBUG "reached point 0\n");`
- Output will go to `dmesg` or `/var/log/messages` (and friends)

# Compile Just One Module

- Super handy!
- Create Makefile in same dir as mceusb.c

```
obj-m += mceusb.o
```

```
all:
```

```
    make -C /lib/modules/$(shell uname -r)/build M=$(PWD) modules
```

```
clean:
```

```
    make -C /lib/modules/$(shell uname -r)/build M=$(PWD) clean
```

# Compile mceusb.c

- `make all`
- `mv /lib/modules/4.0.4-202.fc21.x86_64/kernel/drivers/media/rc/mceusb.ko.xz /lib/modules/4.0.4-202.fc21.x86_64/kernel/drivers/media/rc/mceusb.ko.xz.bak`
- `cp mceusb.ko /lib/modules/4.0.4-202.fc21.x86_64/kernel/drivers/media/rc/`
- `rmmmod mceusb`
- `modprobe mceusb`
- May have to deal with dependent modules
- No reboot required!

# So What Changed?

- `git log drivers/media/rc/mceusb.c`
- And: `git log -p ...`
- DEMO
- git identifies every commit via a unique hash
- Often shortened to unique prefix
- 6 to 8 characters

# What Now? Suspicious!

- Look for suspicious commits
- English text and C code
- Try to reverse those changes
- Using diff/patch
- Or manually if they're small
- But...

# Time Travel

- Why not just “go back in time” in the git tree
- Incompatible commits
- Changes in parent / support libraries
- Refactoring
- Often very rapidly a dead end

# Start Your Emails

- git log showed you committer email addresses
- Get a general idea of who is working on the relevant code:
  - Temporal: around the time where you think the buggy commits occurred
  - Quantity: who is doing the most commits to this code
- I emailed 2 guys and got 1 responding

# Start Your Bisect

- No scalpels needed
- What is git bisect?
  - Binary search
  - Just say Good or Bad
- Not great for intermittent, non-deterministic, hard to reproduce bugs
- Luckily my bug is none of those things



# Pentium-D For Depressingly Slow

- Kernel bisection can require build of entire kernel
- Dozens of times!
- Each build: 4 hours on my Pentium-D (with SSD!)
- Can we leverage distro (Fedora) prepackaged binaries (RPMs) to reduce time?
- Yes...

# Fedora Koji

- Koji = Fedora's automated build system
- Keeps copies of nearly every rpm built
- Amazingly useful resource
- Great web interface
- [http://koji.fedoraproject.org/koji/packageinfo?buildStart=0&packageID=8&buildOrder=-completion\\_time&tagOrder=name&tagStart=0#buildlist](http://koji.fedoraproject.org/koji/packageinfo?buildStart=0&packageID=8&buildOrder=-completion_time&tagOrder=name&tagStart=0#buildlist)
- DEMO

# RPMs From Koji Narrow Search

- Downloading prebuilt kernel RPMs from Koji
  - works:
    - 3.14.0-1.fc21.i686+PAE
    - 3.16.0-1.fc21.i686+PAE
    - 3.16.3-302.fc21.i686+PAE
- Doing my own version of “git bisect”
  - broken:
    - 3.17.0-0.rc7.git1.1.fc22.i686+PAE
    - 3.17.0-301.fc21.i686+PAE
    - 3.17.1-302.fc21.i686+PAE
- Pseudo-binary-searching Koji

# Big Version Problem

- git / kernel use commit hashes (35a19c)
- kernel uses occasional major release numbers to 2 levels of digit groups (3.17)
- Fedora uses complex 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> level (3.17.0-301.fc21.i686+PAE)
- No easy way to convert from Fedora version to git hash
- Worse: Fedora-specific patches, etc
- Heard whispered that Ubuntu might provide a map

# Koji Version To Git

- So my Koji “bisect” only told me:
- But between git version label v3.16 – v3.17
- git prefixes major version release numbers with “v”
- Now we can use git bisect...

# Git Bisect Try #0

- Think bug is in mceusb
- To save time/bisects
- Bisect on just one file, or dir, or dir tree

```
git reset --hard origin/master
```

```
git bisect start drivers/media/rc/mceusb.c
```

```
git bisect good v3.16
```

```
git bisect bad v3.17
```

```
Bisecting: 1 revision left to test after this (roughly 1 step)
```

```
[c5540fbb9de39ceec108a889133664a887c2f55a] [media] rc-core: remove protocol arrays
```

- DEMO

## 2 Commits On mceusb?

- Just use the manual single-module compile idea above after git checks-out
- But those either don't compile (support library changes)
- Or they still present the bug!
- Walk up a dir level...

# Git Bisect Try #1

- Guessing bug is in a file in drivers/media/rc

```
git reset --hard origin/master
```

```
git bisect reset
```

```
git bisect start drivers/media/rc/
```

```
git bisect good v3.16
```

```
git bisect bad v3.17
```

- Still single modules (~3 needed)
- Use aforementioned single-module compile method
- All were bad... failure



# Git Bisect Try #2

- Move up a dir
- Do complete kernel builds this time

```
git bisect start drivers/media
```

```
git bisect good v3.16
```

```
git bisect bad v3.17
```

Bisecting: 196 revisions left to test after this (roughly 8 steps)

# How Do I Fedoraize?

- I'm no kernel hacker
- I don't want to answer kernel config questions to make .config file
- I want this done fast
- I want this done the Fedora way
- I want the resulting kernel to match Fedora's stock kernels as closely as possible

# Ignatenkobrain

- Fedora guy already solved this:
- <http://fedoraproject.org/wiki/User:Ignatenkobrain/Kernel/Bisection>
- Helps you do bisection the “Fedora Way”
- Minimal fuss
- Simple

# Isn't Life Grand

```
$ cd ~
```

```
$ git clone git://git.kernel.org/pub/scm/linux/kernel/git/torvalds/linux.git
```

```
$ git clone http://github.com/ignatenkobrain/kernel-package.git
```

```
$ cd linux
```

```
$ git bisect start
```

```
$ git bisect bad v3.11-rc1
```

```
$ git bisect good v3.9
```

```
$ ~/kernel-package/kernel-package.py
```

# Sucks To Be Me

Traceback (most recent call last):

```
File "../kernel-package/kernel-package.py", line 342, in <module>  
    main()
```

```
File "../kernel-package/kernel-package.py", line 330, in main  
    options = Options(WORK_DIR)
```

```
[...]
```

```
File "/usr/lib/python2.7/site-packages/gitdb/db/pack.py", line 71, in _pack_info  
    index = item[2](sha)
```

```
File "/usr/lib/python2.7/site-packages/gitdb/pack.py", line 492, in sha_to_index  
    return PackIndexFile_sha_to_index(self, sha)
```

**ValueError: Couldn't obtain fanout table**

Exit 1

# Bug #2 ... And Counting

- [https://bugzilla.redhat.com/show\\_bug.cgi?id=1090186](https://bugzilla.redhat.com/show_bug.cgi?id=1090186)
- Doh!
- So “easy” Fedora Way is out

# Manual “Fedora Way”

- Let Fedora make the .config file for you
- Then steal their .config

```
rpmdev-setuptree
```

```
yumdownloader --source kernel
```

```
yum-builddep --downloadonly kernel
```

```
yum-builddep kernel
```

```
cd ~/rpmbuild
```

```
# have rpm "prep" the build
```

```
cd ~/rpmbuild/SPECS
```

```
# normal pkgs: rpmbuild -bp --target=`uname -m` kernel.spec
```

```
# to speed up kernel prep disable what you don't use
```

```
rpmbuild -bp --without xen --without kdump --without debug --without debuginfo --target=`uname -m` kernel.spec
```

```
cp ~/rpmbuild/BUILD/linux-*/.config ~/linux
```

# Build Your Kernel

- `cd ~/linux; make bzImage`

```
HOSTCC scripts/basic/fixdep
```

```
fixdep: error fstat'ing depfile: scripts/basic/.fixdep.d: Value too large for defined data type
```

```
scripts/Makefile.host:118: recipe for target 'scripts/basic/fixdep' failed
```

```
make[2]: *** [scripts/basic/fixdep] Error 2
```

```
/data/Tmp/Linux-git/linux-git/Makefile:443: recipe for target 'scripts_basic' failed
```

```
make[1]: *** [scripts_basic] Error 2
```

```
SYSTBL arch/x86/syscalls/./include/generated/asm/syscalls_32.h
```

```
SYSHDR arch/x86/syscalls/./include/generated/uapi/asm/unistd_32.h
```

```
SYSHDR arch/x86/syscalls/./include/generated/uapi/asm/unistd_64.h
```

```
SYSHDR arch/x86/syscalls/./include/generated/uapi/asm/unistd_x32.h
```

```
HOSTCC scripts/basic/fixdep
```

```
fixdep: error fstat'ing depfile: scripts/basic/.fixdep.d: Value too large for defined data type
```

```
scripts/Makefile.host:118: recipe for target 'scripts/basic/fixdep' failed
```

```
make[1]: *** [scripts/basic/fixdep] Error 2
```

```
Makefile:443: recipe for target 'scripts_basic' failed
```

```
make: *** [scripts_basic] Error 2
```





# Bug #3 ... And Counting

- `scripts/Makefile.host:118: recipe for target 'scripts/basic/fixdep' failed`
- `fixdep` has a bug!
- It breaks when used on a 32-bit system with a 64-bit inode filesystem like XFS and 64-bit inodes are present
- Guess what my system has?
- `#@&^%!%*`

# Gimme Space 40G SSD

- My system has a 40GB SSD as boot, root, swap
- Had to clear up ~10GB for kernel + build
- fixdep now works
- Bonus: SSD speeds instead of RAID6 rust speeds

# Build Your Kernel (Redux)

- `make bzImage && make modules && make modules_install && make install`
- Automagically makes the initramfs for you (dracut?)
- Just works
- reboot
- `rm -rf` previous attempts in `/lib/modules` and `/boot` (but not rpm ones!)

# Test: Naughty Or Nice?

- irsend SEND\_ONCE dct700 info
- git bisect bad
- git bisect good
- Eventually...
- first bad commit:  
[ae045e2455429c418a418a3376301a9e5753a0a8]  
Merge  
git://git.kernel.org/pub/scm/linux/kernel/git/davem/net-next

# What Did I Just Do?

- git bisect log

```
git bisect start drivers/media
```

```
# good: [19583ca584d6f574384e17fe7613dfaeadc4a6] Linux 3.16
```

```
git bisect good 19583ca584d6f574384e17fe7613dfaeadc4a6
```

```
# good: [19583ca584d6f574384e17fe7613dfaeadc4a6] Linux 3.16
```

```
git bisect good 19583ca584d6f574384e17fe7613dfaeadc4a6
```

```
# good: [67dd8f35c2d8ed80f26c9654b474cffc11c6674d] Merge branch 'v4l_for_linus' of  
git://git.kernel.org/pub/scm/linux/kernel/git/mchehab/linux-media
```

```
git bisect good 67dd8f35c2d8ed80f26c9654b474cffc11c6674d
```

```
[...]
```

```
# good: [c835a677331495cf137a7f8a023463afd9f032f8] net: set name_assign_type in alloc_netdev()
```

```
git bisect good c835a677331495cf137a7f8a023463afd9f032f8
```

```
# good: [8fd90bb889635fa1e7f80a3950948cc2e74c1446] Merge git://git.kernel.org/pub/scm/linux/kernel/git/davem/net
```

```
git bisect good 8fd90bb889635fa1e7f80a3950948cc2e74c1446
```

```
# first bad commit: [ae045e2455429c418a418a3376301a9e5753a0a8] Merge git://git.kernel.org/pub/scm/linux/kernel/git/davem/net-next
```

# That Commit Seems Harmless

- If the commit git bisect says is bad looks OK
- AND
- You are limiting your bisect to a subset (dir)
- Remember there can be, hiding between seemingly adjacent commits in the subdir, many commits outside that subdir
- Your bug is probably outside the subdir

# Git Bisect Try #3

- Use the knowledge from Try #2
- git bisect log showed at the end:
- good 8fd90b
- bad ae045e
- So now, NO PATH on start!

```
git reset --hard origin/master
```

```
git bisect reset
```

```
git bisect start
```

```
git bisect good 8fd90b
```

```
git bisect bad ae045e
```

# Twist Ending

- first bad commit:  
[166afb64511eef08e13331b970c44fe91cea45ef] ktime: Sanitize ktime\_to\_us/ms conversion
- In include/linux/ktime.h
- Huh?



# Git Reveals All

- **git diff 166afb64511^ 166afb64511**

```
diff --git a/include/linux/ktime.h b/include/linux/ktime.h
```

```
+#if BITS_PER_LONG < 64
```

```
+extern u64 ktime_divns(const ktime_t kt, s64 div);
```

```
+#else /* BITS_PER_LONG < 64 */
```

```
+# define ktime_divns(kt, div) (u64)((kt).tv64 / (div))
```

```
+#endif
```

```
static inline s64 ktime_to_us(const ktime_t kt) {
```

```
- struct timeval tv = ktime_to_timeval(kt);
```

```
- return (s64) tv.tv_sec * USEC_PER_SEC +  
tv.tv_usec;
```

```
+ return ktime_divns(kt, NSEC_PER_USEC);
```

```
}
```

```
static inline s64 ktime_to_ms(const ktime_t kt) {
```

```
- struct timeval tv = ktime_to_timeval(kt);
```

```
- return (s64) tv.tv_sec * MSEC_PER_SEC +  
tv.tv_usec / USEC_PER_MSEC;
```

```
+ return ktime_divns(kt, NSEC_PER_MSEC);
```

# Ultimate Test: rpmbuild

- To ensure it works the “Fedora Way”
- Make a patch to undo this simple, small commit
- `yumdownloader --source kernel`
- `rpm -i kernel*.src.rpm`
- Add it to the latest Fedora kernel SPEC file from `src.rpm` and `rpmbuild`

# Make The Patch

```
rm -rf /tmp/S
mkdir /tmp/S
# To work with the after-fedora-patches-applied source (probably what you want), have rpm "prep" the build:
cd ~/rpmbuild/SPECS
# limit what I don't need for build
rpmbuild -bp --without xen --without kdump --without debug --without debuginfo --target=`uname -m` kernel*
mv ~/rpmbuild/BUILD/kernel* /tmp/S/a
cp -a /tmp/S/a /tmp/S/b
# if kernel, reduce the dirs by a level
mv /tmp/S/a/linux*/.* /tmp/S/a/linux*/.[A-z]* /tmp/S/a
mv /tmp/S/b/linux*/.* /tmp/S/b/linux*/.[A-z]* /tmp/S/b
rm -rf /tmp/S/a/linux* /tmp/S/a/vanilla*
rm -rf /tmp/S/b/linux* /tmp/S/b/vanilla*
# edit the files you want in the /tmp/B source tree
cd /tmp/S/b
# make the patch
(cd /tmp/S; diff -uNr a b > ~/rpmbuild/SOURCES/patchfile)
```

# Add Patch to Specfile

\* specfile format may have changed a bit; basically you need to reference your patch in 2 diff places in the specfile, just do what the other patches have done

```
# add the patch to the spec file
```

```
# after SourceX: directives add
```

```
Patch1: patchfile
```

```
# then in the %prep area before the %build add a matching line:
```

```
%patch -p 1
```

```
# could also change version #, but I found that tedious, I just used  
same version #
```

# Build And Install RPM

```
cd ~/rpmbuild
```

```
nice -19 rpmbuild -ba SPECS/specfile
```

```
yum reinstall RPMS/kernel*PAE*
```

(or whatever version you need)

```
# Ensure your grub2 default kernel is the one  
above
```

```
reboot
```

# Hooray!

- Bug is gone in kernel built and installed the “Fedora Way” exactly as Koji would build it
- With all Fedora patches
- With all Fedora custom .config
- Success!
- March 23: two weeks in
- Done yet?...

# Now For A Real Fix

- Don't want to jump through hoops every time a new kernel update is released
- Need to get a real fix made
- And get it in mainline kernel

# LKML

- Post to the Linux Kernel Mailing List
- Made a kernel.org bugzilla ticket
- Crickets



# Getting Attention

- After no LKML response
- Kept updating RHBZ, sounding desperate
- Josh Boyer of RedHat eventually replied:

"LKML is kind of a dumping ground for patches and if you didn't have the right maintainers CC'd it likely didn't even get read."

# Re-Post

- On advice of Josh
- Resent LKML email
- With CC:'s he recommended
- Specific developers

# Very Helpful

- The CC'd guys immediately answered
- Provided debug (more printk's) patches
- Then testing patches
- Then final patches
- Easily compiled/tested following  
aforementioned rpmbuild instructions
- <https://lkml.org/lkml/2015/4/30/5>
- <https://lkml.org/lkml/2015/5/8/681>

# Aid The Process

- When a patch is posted to LKML, test it
- Reply with full quoted text
- Right after the > Reported-by:
- Add a new line confirming your test:
- Tested-By: Trevor Cordes <trevor@tecnopolis.ca> [runtime test i686-PAE]
- Automated system tracks all these headers

# My Hunch Was Right

- The LKML debug patch output this:
- JDB: ktime\_to\_us: -20157485 -> divns  
18446744073689394 != old method: -20158
- Proof that:
  - Negative numbers passed in
  - Causing two's-complement signed to unsigned conversion bug
  - University is handy!

# Upshot

- The result from the ktime function
- Probably used for a sleep/delay by lirc
- Negative sleep = no sleep = OK
- Sleep of 18446744073689394ns very bad
- In 584 years the sleep would return
- I'm not that patient

# Final Patch & Commit

- 2 weeks later
- commit f7bcb70ebae0dcdb5a2d859b09e4465784d99029

ktime: Fix ktime\_divns to do signed division

It was noted that the 32bit implementation of ktime\_divns() was doing unsigned division and didn't properly handle negative values.

And when a ktime helper was changed to utilize ktime\_divns, it caused a regression on some IR blasters.

See the following bugzilla for details: [https://bugzilla.redhat.com/show\\_bug.cgi?id=1200353](https://bugzilla.redhat.com/show_bug.cgi?id=1200353)

This patch fixes the problem in ktime\_divns by checking and preserving the sign bit, and then reapplying it if appropriate after the division, it also changes the return type to a s64 to make it more obvious this is expected.

Nicolas also pointed out that negative dividers would cause infinite loops on 32bit systems, negative dividers is unlikely for users of this function, but out of caution this patch adds checks for negative dividers for both 32-bit (BUG\_ON) and 64-bit(WARN\_ON) versions to make sure no such use cases creep in.

# Headers: I'm Famous

Fixes: 166afb64511e 'ktime: Sanitize ktime\_to\_us/ms conversion'

Reported-and-tested-by: **Trevor Cordes** <trevor@tecnopolis.ca>

Signed-off-by: John Stultz <john.stultz@linaro.org>

Acked-by: Nicolas Pitre <nicolas.pitre@linaro.org>

Cc: Ingo Molnar <mingo@kernel.org>

Cc: Josh Boyer <jwboyer@redhat.com>

Cc: One Thousand Gnomses <gnomes@lxorguk.ukuu.org.uk>

Cc: <stable@vger.kernel.org>

Link: <http://lkml.kernel.org/r/1431118043-23452-1-git-send-email-john.stultz@linaro.org>

Signed-off-by: Thomas Gleixner <tglx@linutronix.de>



# Final Patch (abbr.)

```
-extern u64 __ktime_divns(const ktime_t kt, s64 div);
-static inline u64 ktime_divns(const ktime_t kt, s64 div)
+extern s64 __ktime_divns(const ktime_t kt, s64 div);
+static inline s64 ktime_divns(const ktime_t kt, s64 div) {
+    /* Negative divisors could cause an inf loop, so bug out here. */
+    BUG_ON(div < 0);
+    if (__builtin_constant_p(div) && !(div >> 32)) {
-        u64 ns = kt.tv64;
-        do_div(ns, div);
-        return ns;
+        s64 ns = kt.tv64;
+        u64 tmp = ns < 0 ? -ns : ns;
+        do_div(tmp, div);
+        return ns < 0 ? -tmp : tmp;
+    } else { return __ktime_divns(kt, div); }
}
```

# Now For Fedora

- Fedora took up the kernel version that had the commit 1 week later, on May 28
- Into Fedora testing repo
- Easy to test:
  - `yum --enablerepo=updates-testing update kernel`
  - `reboot`

# Aid Fedora

- Karma! Fedora Bodhi
- Essentially a +1/-1 system
- I can test and report success by “leaving karma”
- Command line or web
- RHBZ automatically provides direct link
- [https://admin.fedoraproject.org/updates/FEDORA-2015-9127/kernel-4.0.4-202.fc21?\\_csrf\\_token=3e28dbc9c4b0575e3c37583afc9b28434166a598#](https://admin.fedoraproject.org/updates/FEDORA-2015-9127/kernel-4.0.4-202.fc21?_csrf_token=3e28dbc9c4b0575e3c37583afc9b28434166a598#)
- Click “add comment” – “solves my bug”

# Fedora Updates

- 4 days after Bodhi test build
- Update pushed to normal Fedora Updates
- For one and all!

There!

See, It's THAT EASY

# Lessons Learned #0

- Distro builds (RPMs) are of limited usefulness because of version mismatches
- Mostly because of git
- Non-git programs might be easier

# Lessons Learned #1

- Bisecting a subset is risky
- Might end up doing a whole-tree bisect anyhow
- If bisecting but not building all, ensure your starting “good” and “bad” are really so, don’t assume

# Lessons Learned #2

- CC: people on LKML manually
- Ask others to suggest likely candidates
- Don't spam
- Don't nag



# Lessons Learned #3

- Kernel.org bugzilla was completely useless
- No one CC'd, replied, or touched it
- Doubt anyone saw it
- Distro bugzilla far more useful
- But not always a panacea